

Module 5
Participant Guide

Focus on Deepening
Implementation

Connecticut Core Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy



Grades 6–12

Systems of Professional Learning

Connecticut Core Standards Systems of Professional Learning

The material in this guide was developed by Public Consulting Group in collaboration with staff from the Connecticut State Department of Education and the RESC Alliance. The development team would like to specifically thank Ellen Cohn, Charlene Tate Nichols, and Jennifer Webb from the Connecticut State Department of Education; Leslie Abbatiello from ACES; and Robb Geier, Elizabeth O’Toole, and Cheryl Liebling from Public Consulting Group.

The Systems of Professional Learning project includes a series of professional learning experiences for Connecticut Core Standards District Coaches in English Language Arts, Mathematics, Humanities, Science, Technology, Engineering, Mathematics (STEM), and Student/Educator Support Staff (SESS).

Participants will have continued support for the implementation of the new standards through virtual networking opportunities and online resources to support the training of educators throughout the state of Connecticut.

Instrumental in the design and development of the Systems of Professional Learning materials from PCG were: Sharon DeCarlo, Debra Berlin, Mary Ellen Hannon, Jennifer McGregor, Judy Buck, Michelle Wade, Nora Kelley, Diane Stump, and Melissa Pierce.

Published 2014. Available online at <http://ctcorestandards.org/>



Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| INTRODUCTORY ACTIVITIES | 4 |
| Pre-Assessment–CCS-ELA & Literacy..... | 4 |
| PART 1: SHARING SUCCESSES AND CHALLENGES | 6 |
| Activity 1: Sharing Success and Challenges | 6 |
| PART 2: SUPPORTING TEACHERS IN THE CHANGE PROCESS | 8 |
| Activity 2a: Supporting Teachers in Making the Change to CCS-aligned Instruction..... | 8 |
| Think-Pair-Share | 12 |
| Activity 2b: Providing Effective Feedback | 14 |
| Essential Skills for Coaches in Action..... | 14 |
| PART 3: ASSESSING WRITTEN CURRICULUM WITH THE EQUIP RUBRIC | 17 |
| Activity 3a: Building Expertise with the EQUIP Rubric..... | 17 |
| Activity 3b: Reviewing the Quality of a Written Lesson with the EQUIP Rubric..... | 18 |
| PART 4: COLLABORATIVE EXAMINATION OF STUDENT WORK FROM PERFORMANCE TASKS | 20 |
| Activity 4: Examining Student Work from a Performance Task | 20 |
| Modified* EQUIP Student Work Protocol | 21 |
| PART 5: INTRODUCING AND USING THE CONNECTICUT CORE STANDARDS CLASSROOM “LOOK FOR” GUIDE | 24 |
| Activity 5a: Assessing a Video Lesson Using the “Look Fors” Guide | 24 |
| Activity 5b: Debriefing a Lesson | 27 |
| Essential Skills for Coaches Guide | 27 |
| PART 6: REFLECTION AND PLANNING | 31 |
| Activity 6a: Focus on Deepening Implementation | 31 |
| Give One, Get One, Move On..... | 33 |
| Activity 6b: Action Planning | 34 |
| CLOSING ACTIVITIES | 35 |
| Post-Assessment–CCS-ELA & Literacy | 35 |
| Session Evaluation | 35 |
| NOTEPAD FOR MODULE 5 | 36 |
| REFERENCES | 38 |
| APPENDIX – SAMPLE TEXTS | 39 |
| Voices from Little Rock: Understanding the Civil Rights Movement Through Primary Sources..... | 39 |
| Unit 3 - Andrew Carnegie: “The Gospel of Wealth” (1889) – A Close Reading..... | 44 |

Today's Agenda

Morning Session

- Opening Activities and Pre-Assessment
- Sharing Successes and Challenges
- Supporting Teachers in the Change Process
- Assessing Written Curriculum with the EQUiP Rubric
- Collaborative Examination of Student Work

Afternoon Session

- Using the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide
- Reflection and Planning

Post-Assessment, Session Evaluation, and Wrap Up

Introductory Activities

Introductory Activities

Pre-Assessment–CCS-ELA & Literacy

Instructions: Check the box on the scale that best represents your knowledge or feelings about the CCS-ELA & Literacy in your classroom.

| Self-Assessment Questions | No | Somewhat | Yes | Absolutely, and I could teach it to someone else |
|--|----|----------|-----|--|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| I have a deep understanding of how to support teachers in my school or district through the change process. | | | | |
| I know the Seven Norms of Collaboration, and am able to use them to facilitate conversations with individuals and groups. | | | | |
| I am familiar with the components of the EQuIP Rubric and its role in assessing written lesson and unit development and alignment. | | | | |
| I know how to collaboratively analyze student work from a performance task and provide feedback to the teacher as to the quality of the performance task. | | | | |
| I have a deep understanding of the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide and how to provide feedback to colleagues using the guide. | | | | |
| I am able to facilitate collaborative conversations and professional learning for my colleagues related to the key components of the modules throughout the Connecticut Core Standards System of Professional Learning series. | | | | |

Discussion Prompt: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 36 to capture your thoughts.)



Jot down ideas to share with fellow Core Standards Coaches about activities or conversations you facilitated in your school or district relative to Module 4. If you encountered challenges, feel free to share those as well!

Part 1: Sharing Successes and Challenges

Part 1: Sharing Successes and Challenges

Activity 1: Sharing Success and Challenges

DESCRIPTION

Participants will note successes, challenges, activities, and conversations that have arisen in their school or district relative to Module 4.

DIRECTIONS

1. Choose one participant from your table to be the recorder/speaker for your table.
2. At your table, share your Notepad responses from the Introductory Activity containing your implementation experiences.
3. Note successes, challenges, activities, and conversations that have arisen in your school or district relative to Module 4.
4. As a full group, you will participate in two rounds of reporting:
 - a. Round 1: Recorder/speaker will share activities and successes.
 - b. Round 2: Recorder/speaker will share questions and challenges.

RESOURCES

- Notepad responses

Part 2: Supporting Teachers in the Change Process

Part 2: Supporting Teachers in the Change Process

Activity 2a: Supporting Teachers in Making the Change to CCS-aligned Instruction

DESCRIPTION

Participants will use the *Stages of Concerns Continuum* to identify where a fictional teacher may be regarding implementation of the CT Core Standards. Participants will determine ways to support the teacher as she moves through the change process and discuss ways to support their own staff as they continue to implement the standards and a new curriculum.

DIRECTIONS

1. Read the *Supporting Staff through the Stages of Concern Continuum* on following page.
2. With a partner, read Part A of the scenario about a fictional teacher. Using the *Stages of Concern Continuum*, the partners will identify where this teacher is on the continuum.
3. After discussing questions on Part A, read Part B of the scenario and discuss the questions.
4. As a table group, discuss the end of activity discussion prompts. You may record your reflections in the Notepad section on page 36.

RESOURCES

- *Supporting Staff Through the Stages of Concern Continuum*. Adapted from: Hall, G.E. & Hord, S.M. (2006). *Implementing change: Patterns, principles, and potholes* (2nd ed). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- *Stages of Change: Fictional Case Study*. Adapted from Expeditionary Learning. July 2013 NTI: Grades 3-8 ELA Turnkey Kit - Session 3B. EngageNY

Supporting Staff through the Stages of Concern Continuum

| Stages of Concern | School Realities You will hear or see... | Coaching Suggestions You might want to... |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| 5/6: Collaboration/ Refocusing | I started telling other people about how this is working. I can't wait to share the student work from this project. I love doing this. Can I present at a workshop? | Provide opportunities for action research, to present/publish, capture new ideas for adaptation of module lessons, allow for experimentation, acknowledge expertise. |
| 4: Consequence | This is working for lots of my kids! I was surprised that the kids... I am looking for ways to make this better. Help me meet the specific needs of ELLs/Special Ed kids/high achieving kids... | Provide specific, targeted PD (how does this work when...?) Individual conversations/feedback. Provide opportunities to peer coach, share experiences, collaborate with others, present at department meetings and other internal structures, opportunities to present at outside workshops. |
| 3: Management | I can't believe how long it takes me to plan each class. I worked all weekend on this. I tried something new and it was great/a disaster! I am still trying to figure out how to use/do... | Provide TIME and RESOURCES. "Make and take" type sessions, structured individual and small group problem solving conversations. Peer coaching/feedback. Co-planning. Use tuning protocols (warm/cool feedback). Offer release time to see/talk to others who are implementing. |
| 2: Personal | Huh, seems like this will take a lot of work. Where am I going to get...? Can you help me find something? Can you help me make a...? | Provide implementation workshops. Offer websites, books, resources, models, co-planning and feedback. |
| 1: Informational | I liked your workshop but I am not sure what this has to do with me. These are interesting articles. It helped me to hear you describe what you are doing in your classroom. I don't think this will work in my classroom. I don't think I have time for this. | Acknowledge the challenge but focus on how the work is worth it for kids. Tell stories of how you've seen it working. Gather and provide lots of models and materials. Keep talking/sharing/modeling. Let the person hear about it from other sources. |
| 0: Awareness | I think I remember hearing about this. That never works. We did this back in 1970. What goes around comes around. | Leadership: Clearly present expectations to participate. Provide opportunities to learn. |

Adapted from Hall, G. E. & Hord, S.M. (2006). *Implementing change: Patterns, principles, and potholes* (2nd ed.). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

STAGES OF CHANGE: FICTIONAL CASE STUDY**ACME Middle School****The Case of David*****PART A – PLEASE READ THIS FIRST***

ACME Middle School is planning a full implementation of the CT Core Standards for grades 6–8 in the 2014–2015 school year. Before school ended in the summer of the 2013–2014 school year, the faculty received professional development about close reading, writing from sources, vocabulary development, and the content of the standards through a vertical progression activity.

David, whose students had been getting solid results on previous years' Connecticut Mastery Tests (CMT), grew very concerned about what the changes he saw coming meant for his teaching. He wondered, "What if my kids don't do well?" "What impact will this have on my SEED results?" "I've always been a good teacher. What if I won't be one now, according to my principal?"

David fluctuated between excitement about the potential impact the standards could have on his students' achievement and anxiety about the unknown consequences over the course of the summer. He vacillated between these emotions depending on whom he was speaking with and what their comfort level was with the CT Core Standards' implementation; he did not like feeling so uncertain. He felt like he had really just finally figured out the right routines and practices that worked for him and his students and was very uncomfortable with the idea that these might have to change.

Talk about these questions with a partner:

- What do you think is going on for David? At what *Stage of Concern* is he, and why do you think that?
- What would you do as a member of the Instructional Leadership Team or as Literacy Coach?

PLEASE DISCUSS YOUR IDEAS BEFORE LOOKING AT PART B

PART B – PLEASE READ PART A FIRST

David has personal concerns about his ability to do the actual work required of him. He needs to feel a sense of motivation and encouragement. He also feels a great sense of stress. Despite clarity about why the school is doing this, reminders that they have been talking about implementing the standards for a while, and reassurance that everyone will receive the proper professional development in an ongoing manner, David remains anxious.

The literacy coach, Beth, who has a strong working relationship with David, scheduled a 30-minute one-on-one check-in with David once the school year started each week in order to give David an opportunity to ask questions and to see how he was doing. They followed a basic discussion protocol that consisted of: what went well teaching the new standards, what the areas for growth were, what David’s goals for the upcoming week were, and if there was anything Beth could do to support David in the next week. Initially, David had a tendency to sidetrack the conversation, but Beth used the protocol skillfully to generate a productive conversation and point out to David what he had been doing really well to continue to build his confidence and motivation.

After the first month of school, David’s anxiety subsided. He let Beth know that he did not feel the need to have the weekly check-ins and that he really needed that time to prepare materials and to plan for class. Beth reassured David that if he should change his mind, they could reinstate the meetings at any time or she could come into his classroom to provide support in any way.

Talk about these questions with a partner:

- You many have your own ideas about how to approach a check-in session. How are your ideas similar or different to what happened in this case?
- How do you think the approach described above will move David and the school’s initiative forward?
- How can this approach assist you in working with resistant staff?

Adapted from: Expeditionary Learning. July 2013 NTI: Grades 3-8 ELA Turnkey Kit - Session 3B. EngageNY <https://www.engageny.org/resource/july-2013-nti-grades-3-8-ela-turnkey-kit-session-2b>.

Discussion Prompts: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 36 to capture your thoughts.)



How do teachers’ *concerns* change as they move through the change process?

How can the questions teachers ask provide information for coaches?

How do teachers’ *attitudes* change as they become more familiar with knowledge and practices involved in a change?

Think-Pair-Share

DIRECTIONS

1. Read the *Seven Norms of Collaboration* on the following page.
2. Select one norm that you do well and one norm you would like to improve upon.
3. Pair with a neighbor and explain the norm that you do well and give an example, as well as an example of a norm on which you would like to improve.
4. Discuss with your table: Are there commonalities among your choices?

RESOURCES

- *Seven Norms of Collaboration*. Adapted from Garmston, R., and Wellman, B. (2009) *The Adaptive School: A Sourcebook for Developing Collaborative Groups*, 2nd edition. Norwood, MA: Christopher Gordon. Retrieved from <http://www.thinkingcollaborative.com/norms-collaboration-toolkit/>
- *Supporting Staff Through the Stages of Concern Continuum*. Adapted from: Hall, G.E. & Hord, S.M. (2006). *Implementing change: Patterns, principles, and potholes* (2nd ed). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- *Stages of Change: Fictional Case Study*. Adapted from Expeditionary Learning. July 2013 NTI: Grades 3-8 ELA Turnkey Kit-Session 3B. EngageNY

SEVEN NORMS OF COLLABORATION

1. Promoting a Spirit of Inquiry

Exploring perceptions, assumptions, beliefs, and interpretations promotes the development of understanding. Inquiring into the ideas of others before advocating for one's own ideas is important to productive dialogue and discussion.

2. Pausing

Pausing before responding or asking a question allows time for thinking and enhances dialogue, discussion, and decision-making.

3. Paraphrasing

Using a paraphrase starter that is comfortable for you – “So...” or “As you are...” or “You’re thinking...” – and following the starter with an efficient paraphrase assists members of the group in hearing and understanding one another as they converse and make decisions.

4. Probing

Using gentle open-ended probes or inquiries – “Please say more about...” or “I’m interested in...” or “I’d like to hear more about...” or “Then you are saying...” increases the clarity and precision of the group’s thinking.

5. Putting ideas on the Table

Ideas are the heart of meaningful dialogue and discussion. Label the intention of your comments. For example: “Here is one idea...” or “One thought I have is...” or “Here is a possible approach...” or “Another consideration might be...”.

6. Paying Attention to Self and Others

Meaningful dialogue and discussion are facilitated when each group member is conscious of self and of others, and is aware of what (s)he is saying and how it is said as well as how others are responding. This includes paying attention to learning styles when planning, facilitating, and participating in group meetings and conversations.

7. Presuming Positive Intentions

Assuming that others’ intentions are positive promotes and facilitates meaningful dialogue and discussion, and prevents unintentional put-downs. Using positive intentions in speech is one manifestation of this norm.

Adapted from Garmston, R., and Wellman, B. (2009) *The Adaptive School: A Sourcebook for Developing Collaborative Groups*, 2nd edition. Norwood, MA: Christopher Gordon. Retrieved from <http://www.thinkingcollaborative.com/norms-collaboration-toolkit/>

Activity 2b: Providing Effective Feedback

DESCRIPTION

Participants identify five essential skills for CT coaches that will support them when providing feedback to teachers. Through the use of a coaching session video, they will recognize the use of the essential skills to enable the teacher to grow instructional skills in the classroom.

DIRECTIONS

1. Watch the video of a coaching session. Using the *Essential Skills for Coaches in Action* tool below as a guide, observe the various skills the coach uses during the session.
2. Record elements of the coaching session that reflect the five essential skills.
3. After watching the video, discuss in your group essential skills that the coach effectively used during the session. Include in your discussions, ‘missed opportunities’ that would have made for a stronger coaching conference.

Essential Skills for Coaches in Action

| Essential Skill | Evidence in Action from Conference Video |
|---------------------------------------|--|
| Increasing Teacher’s Capacity | |
| Active Listening | |
| Thoughtful and Reflective Questioning | |

| Essential Skill | Evidence in Action from Conference Video |
|------------------------------|--|
| Providing Effective Feedback | |
| Building Relationships | |

Discussion Prompts: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 36 to capture your thoughts.)



What elements of the Essential Skills for CT coaches did the observer use competently throughout the coaching session?

Where do you think there were ‘missed opportunities’ within the discussion? What would you have added to the discussion to strengthen the coaching session?

RESOURCES

- *Essential Skills for Coaches in Action* tool

VIDEO

- *Observation and Feedback: Probing to Identify the Problem* (2012). Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bBeNs1Q2kXk>

Part 3: Assessing Written Curriculum with the EQuIP Rubric

Part 3: Assessing Written Curriculum with the EQuIP Rubric

Activity 3a: Building Expertise with the EQuIP Rubric

DESCRIPTION

Using a jigsaw approach, participants will read, discuss, and build expertise on one section of the EQuIP Rubric and share with their table groups.

DIRECTIONS

1. Participants at each table group will be assigned a dimension of the EQuIP Rubric by the facilitator. The dimensions will be: 1) Depth and Rigor of CCS; 2) Key Shifts in the CCS; 3) Instructional Support; and, 4) Assessment.
2. Read and discuss the assigned EQuIP Rubric dimension, becoming experts in that area.
3. When completed, put the number of your table group on a sticky note. When prompted by the facilitator, “remix with others” and form new groups of four representing each dimension in the EQuIP Rubric.
4. Each “expert” will share key understandings of their assigned dimension with other members of the group.

Discussion Prompt: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 36 to capture your thoughts.)



How can the EQuIP Rubric assist teachers in developing a deeper understanding of their CCS-aligned curriculum?

RESOURCES

- EQuIP Rubric. Retrieved from <http://www.achieve.org/EQuIP>

Activity 3b: Reviewing the Quality of a Written Lesson with the EQuIP Rubric

DESCRIPTION

Based on the selected sample texts located in the Appendix starting on page 39 (Grades 6–8: *Voices from Little Rock* or Grades 9–12: *Andrew Carnegie: “The Gospel of Wealth”*), participants will review the quality of a written lesson using the EQuIP Rubric and discuss ways to use the rubric within their school.

DIRECTIONS

1. In pairs or triads, review a lesson using the applicable indicators of the EQuIP Rubric.
2. In table groups, come to a consensus on which areas are aligned to the rubric.
3. Discuss how this tool can be used in schools and districts to support implementation of the CCS-ELA & Literacy.
4. Be prepared to share key points from your discussion with the large group.

Discussion Prompt: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 36 to capture your thoughts.)



How might you or your colleagues use the EQuIP Rubric in your personal teaching practice?

RESOURCES

- EQuIP Rubric. Retrieved from <http://www.achieve.org/EQuIP>
- Sample Lessons (located in the Appendix):
 - *Grades 6-8: Voices from Little Rock: Understanding the Civil Rights Movement through Primary Sources*. Grade 8 Social Studies: Lesson 8 - Reading Brown vs. Board of Education. Retrieved From: <http://achievethecore.org/page/814/voices-from-little-rock-understanding-the-civil-rights-movement-through-primary-sources>
 - *Grades 9-12: Andrew Carnegie: “The Gospel of Wealth” (1889)* – A Close Reading Grade 11. Retrieved from: http://ctcorestandards.org/?page_id=2623

**Part 4: Collaborative Examination of Student Work from
Performance Tasks**

Part 4: Collaborative Examination of Student Work from Performance Tasks

Activity 4: Examining Student Work from a Performance Task

DESCRIPTION

Participants will deepen their understanding of performance tasks as evidence of student learning.

DIRECTIONS

1. Form a group of four participants.
2. Select a facilitator and recorder. Locate the lesson plan for literacy, as well as the student work samples handouts.
3. Read the lesson and complete the following steps in the protocol, using the template on the following page.
 - a. Focus on the assignment itself and analyze purpose and demands without consulting the standards.
 - b. Analyze targeted standards and identify gaps in alignment.
 - c. Describe how students performed on the assignment and if they met the expectations of targeted standards.
 - d. Provide criterion-based feedback regarding assignment and instruction.

Discussion Prompt: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 37 to capture your thoughts.)



How realistic (or authentic) can a performance task be if it is to be both engaging *and* an effective measure of student learning?

RESOURCES

- Modified EQuIP Student Work Protocol: *Modified for CT Core Standards Systems of Professional Learning from EQuIP Student Work Protocol - ELA/Literacy. Retrieved from http://www.achieve.org/files/ELA%20Student%20Work%20Protocol%20FINAL_1.pdf
- NYC Department of Education. Grades 9-10 “The Power of New Media” Performance Task. Retrieved from http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/8C901879-B581-437F-8531-2EF5BF51FAB7/0/NYCDOEG9_10LiteracyNewMedia_Final.pdf
- NYC Department of Education. Grades 9-10 “The Power of New Media” Student work. Retrieved from http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/1890B8B6-8131-43BB-AFC1-7E4CA4EE3EF9/0/NYCDOEG9_10LiteracyNewMedia_StudentWorkNoAnnotation.pdf

Modified* EQUIP Student Work Protocol

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| <p>Step 1: Identify</p> | <p>Reviewer Name: Title of Assignment: Grade: Date:</p> | |
| <p>Step 2: Review Assignment and Rubrics</p> | <p>Guiding Questions for Reviewing Assignment and Rubric:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Based on the directions and/or the scoring guides for the assignment, what is its likely purpose? (Performances required) Based on the directions and/or the scoring guides for the assignment, what demands does it make of students? (Knowledge and skills required) | |
| <p>Step 3: Compare Standards with Assignment</p> | <p>Guiding Questions for Reviewing Standards and Comparing Alignment of Assignment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Do the directions, prompt(s), and/or scoring guide for the assignment give students the opportunity to demonstrate all or part of the targeted standards for the assignment and lesson/unit? How well aligned are the content and performance(s) of the assignment with the targeted standards in the assignment and the lesson/unit? | |
| | <p>Targeted Standard</p> | <p>Evidence of Alignment or Gaps in Alignment</p> |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>Step 4: Diagnose Student Work</p> | <p>Guiding Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What does the student work communicate about the kind and level of skills and knowledge students have learned and still need to learn? • What are the most frequent and fundamental successes students appear to be having with the assignment? • What are the most frequent and fundamental problems students appear to be having with the assignment? |
| <p>Step 5: Provide Suggestions for Improving the Assignment**</p> | <p>Guiding Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How does the assignment fit into the overall lesson or unit plan?* • What does the review of student work suggest are the strengths and weaknesses of the assignment? • What should be kept, deleted, and/or added to the assignment or lesson/unit for tighter alignment with the depth of the targeted standards? • Do the rubrics/scoring guides accurately communicate CCS expectations for proficiency? If not, how might they be improved? |
| <p>Step 6: Instructional Guidance***</p> | <p>What feedback might you give or what questions might you ask of a colleague to help him or her reflect on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The design and alignment of performance task? • Instruction related to quality of student work? |

*Modified for CT Core Standards Systems of Professional Learning from EQUIP Student Work Protocol – ELA/Literacy. Retrieved from http://www.achieve.org/files/ELA%20Student%20Work%20Protocol%20FINAL_1.pdf

**May not be applicable to today’s exercise.

***Added for today’s coaching conversation.

**Part 5: Introducing and Using the Connecticut Core Standards
Classroom “Look Fors” Guide**

Part 5: Introducing and Using the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide

Activity 5a: Assessing a Video Lesson Using the “Look Fors” Guide

DESCRIPTION

In Activity 5a, participants will use the CT Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” to observe a reading lesson and determine how aligned the practices are to the CT Core Standards.

DIRECTIONS

1. In table groups, select one area of the CT Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” to focus on. Divide the instructional practice areas for each participant to focus on while watching the video lesson.
2. Using the CT Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide as a resource, determine CCS-aligned practices within the lesson.
3. Closely read the instructional practices that should be observed during the video lesson.
4. Watch the video and use the classroom “Look Fors” to gather evidence of the CCS integration within the lesson.
5. Write your observations for each area in the ‘Observable Teacher Action’ column on the following page (a sample has been provided below).
6. After the lesson, discuss the questions on page 26 with your group.

Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Recording Sheet Sample

| Focus Area: <i>Focus Each Lesson on a High-Quality Text (or Multiple Texts)</i> | |
|--|--|
| Instructional Practice Indicator | Observable Teacher Action(s) |
| <i>Example: Instructional Practice A: A majority of the lesson is spent reading, speaking, or writing about text(s).</i> | <i>Example: Teacher interacting with students as they read and re-read the text. Teacher asking questions to student groups that must be cited from the text.</i> |

Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Recording Sheet

| Focus Area: | |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Instructional Practice Indicator | Observable Teacher Action(s) |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |

Discussion Questions:

- What components in your section were clearly evident during the lesson? What evidence did you gather to support your assertions?
- What components in your section were not clearly evident? How did you know?
- What questions do you have after watching the lesson?
- What steps could be taken to further develop this teacher’s skill?

Discussion Prompt: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 37 to capture your thoughts.)



In what ways can the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide support your work with classroom teachers?

RESOURCES

- Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide
- Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Recording Sheet

VIDEO

- *Black Boy* (Smith-Keita). America Achieves. Retrieved from <http://commoncore.americaachieves.org/module/38>

Activity 5b: Debriefing a Lesson

DESCRIPTION

In Activity 5b, participants will follow up the lesson review with an opportunity to develop and provide feedback on the lesson. Participants will use the *Essential Skills for Coaches Guide* to organize their feedback and review a debriefing protocol, which will help support a focused feedback session.

DIRECTIONS

1. After discussing the lesson in your table group, divide into smaller groups of two or three.
2. Using the *Essential Skills for Coaches Guide*, craft talking points that you would use as you provided feedback to the teacher. Be sure to make as many connections as possible with the five essential skills for CT Core Coaches.
3. Share your feedback with your partner. Do you believe that the feedback will ensure a stronger lesson in the future?
4. Review the *Coaches’ Observation and Debriefing Protocol* on page 29. Discuss whether the tool will be effective when working with teachers.
5. Be sure to make as many connections as possible with the five essential skills for CT Core Coaches.

Essential Skills for Coaches Guide

| Essential Skill | Notes for Debriefing Conference |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Increasing Teacher’s Capacity | |
| Active Listening | |

| Essential Skill | Notes for Debriefing Conference |
|--|---------------------------------|
| Thoughtful and Reflective Questioning | |
| Providing Effective Feedback | |
| Building Relationships | |

Coaches' Observation and Debriefing Protocol

Preparation

- a. Determine the classroom to visit based on need and make arrangements with staff.
- b. Determine focus of walkthrough, including specific and/or general “Look Fors.” This should be done in collaboration with classroom teacher.

Walkthrough

- a. Conduct a walkthrough or class observation looking for evidence of teaching/learning connected to the focus area(s) and “Look-Fors.”
- b. Observe specific examples of effective teaching within the classroom.
- c. Document specific examples.

Reflection

- a. Consider trends or themes that emerged from the walkthrough or observation.
- b. Select one or two themes/trends to use in the debriefing session with the classroom teacher.
- c. Select examples that illustrate the theme or trend you observed.
- d. Prepare probing questions to focus discussion on the lesson that will refine and improve instruction.

Group Debriefing

- a. Meet with the teacher in a quiet place that will provide an opportunity for discussion.
- b. Communicate the theme or trend that emerged from the walkthrough or observation.
- c. Give specific examples or evidence that illustrates the theme.
- d. Present a probing question(s) to push the instructional agenda.
- e. Close the debriefing with supports and next steps that will provide direction for the teacher.

Protocol adapted from Group Debriefing Protocol developed by Dr. Otto Graf and Dr. Joseph Werlinich, University of Pittsburgh.

RESOURCES

- Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide
- Essential Skills for Coaches Guide
- Coaches' Observation and Debriefing Protocol

Part 6: Reflection and Planning

Part 6: Reflection and Planning

Activity 6a: Focus on Deepening Implementation

DESCRIPTION

In this final section, participants will look back on the entire module series and identify content or activities that will have the highest impact in their school with colleagues to implement the CCS-ELA & Literacy. Participants will share their thoughts with their colleagues.

DIRECTIONS: PART 1

1. Review the *Topics and Activities from Modules 1–5* below.
2. Part 1: Determine which of the activities or topics you have learned about during Modules 1–5 that will have the highest impact in your school as you work with colleagues to implement the CCS-ELA & Literacy. Record them in the ‘Give One, Get One, Move On’ table on page 33.

Topics and Activities from Modules 1–5

Module 1: Focus on Instructional Shifts

- Overview of the CCS-ELA & Literacy (structure and organization)
- Vertical Progressions: Examining the vertical progressions of the CCS-ELA & Literacy
- Instructional Shifts: Learning about the shifts and creating anchor charts
- Introduction to the EQuIP Rubric
- Rigor in the CT Core Standards Classroom

Module 2: Supporting all Students in Close Reading, Academic Language, and Text-based Discussion

- Annotating for important components of a text-based lesson
- Planning for a close reading lesson
 - Making decisions about vocabulary
 - Creating a sequence of text-dependent questions
- Classroom Discussion
 - Importance of classroom discussion
 - Choosing and explaining a discussion protocol
- Universal Design for Learning

Module 3: Supporting all Students in Writing and Research

- Close Look at the Writing Standards
 - Types of Writing in the CCS-ELA & Literacy (Text-Rendering protocol with the CCSS Intro)
 - Examining grade level expectations (Student writing from *In Common* collection)
- Writing Grounded in Evidence
 - Best practices in writing about text (Jigsaw protocol with Shanahan chapter)
 - Viewing a video and looking at student work from the lesson for evidence of writing instruction
- Looking at Research Instruction in CCS-aligned Research Units
- Supporting Students in Writing

Module 4: Focus on Unit Design

- Overview of Unit and Lesson Design
 - Tracing the Claim (in Wiggins & McTighe article “From Common Core Standards to Curriculum”)
- Stage 1 of Unit Design – Desired Results
 - Choosing standards
 - Adding Understandings and Essential Questions
 - Adding Knowledge and Skills
 - Writing the Unit Overview
- Stage 2 of Unit Design – Performance Tasks and Assessments
 - Performance tasks (GRASPS) and evaluative criteria
- Stage 3 of Unit Design – Designing Learning (Create a learning plan)
- Supporting Teachers in Unit Design

Module 5: Focus on Deepening Implementation

- Supporting Teachers in the Change Process
 - Stages of Concern scenario
 - Essential skills for coaches
- Assessing Written Curriculum with the EQulP Rubric
 - Building expertise
 - Reviewing a lesson
- Collaborative Examination of Student Work
 - Examining student work from a performance task
- Using the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide (Viewing a video lesson and planning feedback)

Give One, Get One, Move On

DIRECTIONS: PART 2

1. After completing the table, stand up and “mill about” the room.
2. At the facilitator’s signal, stop, find a partner, and take turns sharing and explaining one of your priority topics.
3. Be brief. Soon the facilitator will request that you begin “milling about” again.
4. This will be repeated several times to ensure that participants have ample opportunity to share.

| Topic or Activity | Why Is This a Priority? | How Can it Be Shared | Additional Coaching Skills Needed |
|-------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

RESOURCES

- Topics and Activities from Modules 1–5
- Give One, Get One, Move On tool

Activity 6b: Action Planning

DESCRIPTION

After completing the *Give One, Get One, Move On* activity, participants will reflect on what key messages and strategies they would like to take back to their school and share with their colleagues. They will work with their school teams to develop the strategies.

DIRECTIONS

1. Reflect on today’s learning as well as Modules 1–4.
2. Work with your school team (or with a job-alike partner from another school) to develop a strategy for sharing Modules’ 1–5 key messages and resources with colleagues back at your schools.

| Key Messages and Resources | Strategy |
|----------------------------|----------|
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |

Discussion Prompt: (Reminder, Notepad is available on page 37 to capture your thoughts.)



What ideas do you have for how you might use the module content in your school or district?

RESOURCES

- Key Messages and Strategy Table

Closing Activities

Post-Assessment—CCS-ELA & Literacy

Instructions: Check the box on the scale that best represents your knowledge or feelings about the CCS-ELA & Literacy in your classroom.

| Self-Assessment Questions | No | Somewhat | Yes | Absolutely, and I could teach it to someone else |
|---|----|----------|-----|--|
| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| I have a deep understanding of how to support teachers in my school or district through the change process. | | | | |
| I know the Seven Norms of Collaboration, and am able to use them to facilitate conversations with individuals and groups. | | | | |
| I am familiar with the components of the EQuIP Rubric and its role in assessing written lesson and unit development and alignment. | | | | |
| I know how to collaboratively analyze student work from a performance task and provide feedback to the teacher as to the quality of the performance task. | | | | |
| I have a deep understanding of the CT Core Standards “Look Fors” Guide and how to provide feedback to colleagues using the guide. | | | | |
| I am able to facilitate collaborative conversations and professional learning for my colleagues related to the key components of the modules throughout the CT Core Standards System of Professional Learning series. | | | | |

Session Evaluation

Thank you for attending today’s session. Your feedback is very important to us! Please fill out a short survey about today’s session.

The survey is located here: <http://surveys.pcgus.com/s3/CT-ELA-Module-5-6-12>



Notepad for Module 5

Introductory Activity/Part 1: Sharing Successes and Challenges

Record any ideas you have gained from your discussion regarding successes and challenges.

Part 2: Supporting Teachers in the Change Process

Record your thinking regarding the discussion prompts from Activities 2a and 2b.

Part 3: Assessing Written Curriculum with the EQUIP Rubric

How can the EQUIP Rubric assist teachers in developing a deeper understanding of their CCS-aligned curriculum? How might you or your colleagues use the EQUIP Rubric in your personal teaching practice?

Part 4: Collaborative Examination of Student Work from Performance Tasks

How realistic (or authentic) can a performance task be if it is to be both engaging and an effective measure of student learning?

Part 5: Introducing and Using the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide

In what ways can the Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors” Guide support your work with classroom teachers?

Part 6: Reflection and Planning

Record any ideas you have for how you might use the module content in your school or district.

References

- Achieve the Core. CCSS Instructional Practice Guides. Retrieved from <http://achievethecore.org/page/434/ccss-instructional-practice-guides>
- America Achieves (2012). EQuIP Rubrics for Lessons and Units. Retrieved from <http://www.achieve.org/files/EQuIP-ELArubric-06-24-13-FINAL.pdf>
- America Achieves (2012). EQuIP Student Work Protocol. http://www.achieve.org/files/ELA%20Student%20Work%20Protocol%20FINAL_1.pdf
- CSDE. (2014). Connecticut Core Standards Classroom “Look Fors”. Retrieved from http://www.sde.ct.gov/sde/lib/sde/pdf/backtoschool/ccss_principal_look_fors_flipbook.pdf
- Darling-Hammond, L. & Falk, B. (2013). Teacher learning through assessment; How student-performance assessments can support teacher learning. Retrieved from <http://americanprogress.org/issues/education/report/2013/09/12/73978/teacher-learning-through-assessment/>
- Expeditionary Learning. July 2013 NTI: Grades 3-8 ELA Turnkey Kit - Session 3B. EngageNY. Retrieved from <https://www.engageny.org/resource/july-2013-nti-grades-3-8-ela-turnkey-kit-session-2b>.
- Graf, O., & Werlinich, J. (2003). *Protocol for Group Debriefing*. University of Pittsburg.
- Hall, G.E. & Hord, S.M. (2006). *Implementing change: Patterns, principles and potholes: Supporting staff on the change continuum*. (2nd ed.). Boston. Allyn & Bacon.
- Hall, G.E. & Hord, S.M. (2010). *Implementing change: Patterns, principles and potholes: Stages of concern*. Boston. Allyn & Bacon.
- NYC Department of Education. Grades 9-10 “The Power of New Media” Performance Task. Retrieved from http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/8C901879-B581-437F-8531-2EF5BF51FAB7/0/NYCDOEG9_10LiteracyNewMedia_Final.pdf
- NYC Department of Education. Grades 9-10 “The Power of New Media” Student work. Retrieved from http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/1890B8B6-8131-43BB-AFC1-7E4CA4EE3EF9/0/NYCDOEG9_10LiteracyNewMedia_StudentWorkNoAnnotation.pdf
- SEDL. Concerns-Based Adoption Model. Retrieved from <http://www.sedl.org/cbam/>

Videos:

- America Achieves. *Black Boy (Smith-Keita)*. Retrieved from <http://commoncore.americaachieves.org/module/38>
- Uncommon Schools, Inc. (2012). *Observation and Feedback: Probing to Identify the Problem*. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bBeNs1Q2kXk>

Appendix – Sample Texts

Voices from Little Rock: Understanding the Civil Rights Movement Through Primary Sources

Grade 8 Social Studies

A CCSS-Aligned Curricular Module for Middle School Social Studies Teachers. Developed by Expeditionary Learning in Collaboration with Student Achievement Partners

This model Common Core unit is comprised of fifteen 90-minute sessions.

Module overview: This module is comprised of fifteen 90-minute lessons and addresses U.S. History content standards relating to the Civil Rights Movement. It begins with an overview of the Civil Rights Movement that helps students develop a thorough understanding of what civil rights are and how they are obtained and protected, and then moves into the case study of the Little Rock Nine. Following the Brown vs. Board of Education ruling in 1954, schools in Little Rock, Arkansas were ordered to begin the process of integration. In the 1957-1958 school year, nine courageous teenagers were the first African American students to attend the previously all-white Central High School. Supported by their families, the NAACP, and ultimately by federal troops, they practiced non-violent resistance in the face of opposition and animosity from many white politicians, students, and school leaders. Throughout their study of events in Little Rock, students analyze the roles that individuals, groups, and the government played in obtaining and protecting civil rights; they also develop a personal, nuanced answer to the still-relevant question: Who is responsible for protecting civil rights? In addition to engaging students in historical content and issues of civic engagement, the module helps students develop historical thinking skills that are applicable to any social studies content: the ability to critically evaluate primary sources and to consider the significance of the words and ideas in those sources.

Module Big Ideas:

- Historians rely on primary sources to understand the past through the eyes of people who were there. Evaluating a primary source requires analyzing the source and context of the document, as well as corroborating it with other sources. (*Stanford History Education Group*)
- Civil rights are individual freedoms guaranteed to all citizens and residents of a country, regardless of race, gender, religion, etc. These freedoms allow people to participate fully in the political, social, and economic life of a community. These rights include freedom of expression, equal protection under the law, nondiscrimination in housing, education, employment, and public facilities, and the right to full participation in the democratic political system.
[source: "civil rights." *The American Heritage® New Dictionary of Cultural Literacy, Third Edition*. Houghton Mifflin Company, 2005. 12 Oct. 2012. <Dictionary.com
[http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/civil rights](http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/civil%20rights)>]
- Civil rights are obtained and protected through the work of the government (the executive, legislative, and judicial branches), individual citizens, and organizations. No one party can do the work alone.

Module Guiding Questions:

- What are civil rights? Why do they matter? How are civil rights gained and protected?
- Who is responsible for protecting civil rights?
- How can we use a quote to convey the significance of a person, idea, or event in history?

Lesson 8 – Reading *Brown vs. Board of Education***Teaching Notes**

- In this lesson, students read excerpts from the 1954 *Brown vs. Board* Supreme Court ruling. There are several scaffolds provided to support them in understanding this complex text: a teacher read-aloud, the opportunity to discuss each part of the text in groups, and the class debrief of the text dependent questions. Consider focusing struggling readers on one part of the text and one or two text dependent questions: differentiate, in other words, by varying the quantity of the text, not the complexity of it.
- You will use the students’ *Historian’s Notes* as a formative assessment for students’ ability to source, contextualize, and corroborate a primary source document. As you assess their work, select several exemplars to share with the class; also keep a list of points to address with the class as a whole and of individual students to target for more support in the coming lessons. Students will be formally and summatively assessed on this skill in Lesson 11.
- In this lesson, the *Little Rock Case Study Note catcher* provides students with a place to synthesize and hold their thinking about each of the three decisions they will study. They will be able to use this note catcher on the assessment in Lesson 12.
- Continue to refer students to the “Who is responsible for protecting civil rights?” anchor chart, as this is the guiding question for their close reads in this series of lessons.

Lesson 8 Materials

- “Who is responsible for protecting civil rights?” anchor chart
- *Brown vs. Board of Education* (1954) excerpts and *Historian’s Notes*
- Reading like a Historian rubric (from Lesson 5)
- Significant Quotations chart
- Chapter 13, “Linda Brown – and Others,” from *A History of US* by Joy Hakim
- Hakim, Chapter 13 *Historian’s Notes* (from Lesson 7)
- Little Rock Case Study note catcher
- Materials for Gallery Walk (excerpts of *Brown*, flip chart, markers)

Lesson 8 Agenda

1. Entry Task
 - A. Vocabulary practice (5 min)
 - Post correct answers for homework; students correct their work.

- Choral reading of fill in the blank cloze exercise. (Note: reading aloud this work promotes fluency and builds students’ familiarity with these words.)
2. Opening
- A. Framing the lesson (5 min)
- Refer students back to the **“Who is responsible for protecting civil rights?” anchor chart** , and tell them they will keep adding to this chart throughout the case study.
 - At the end of the case study, they will complete a formal (open note) assessment pertaining to how three decisions led to the desegregation of Central High school in the 1957 -58 school year. They will also reflect on what this case study has taught them about who is responsible for protecting civil rights.
 - Tell students that today they will have the chance to look for themselves at one of the most important court cases of the last century: Brown vs. Board of Education. They will show you how well they can read like historians, and they will add to the anchor chart.
3. Work Time: Close read of Brown vs. Board of Education (1954) (excerpts)
- See **Brown vs. Board of Education (1954) (excerpts)** and Historian’s Notes
 - Vocabulary notes:
 - module vocabulary reinforced in text: segregation, equal protection of the law
 - words teacher provides definitions for in the text in advance: undertaken, tangible, facilities, finding, detrimental, denoting, sanction
 - words students determine meaning of in context: deprive, qualifications, generates, doctrine, inherently
 - module vocabulary reinforced in text dependent questions: segregation, equal protection, constitutional
- A. Launch the text (5 min)
- Distribute the text and read the entire text out loud
 - Students do a choral read of the text (standing)
- B. Evaluate the text (10 min)
- Distribute **Historian’s Notes for Brown vs. Board of Education**
 - Students independently do source, context with this text
- C. Student make meaning of the text independently (20 min)
- Gallery Walk (Note: this is a modified version of the Gallery Walk protocol in the appendix. It works best with groups of 3-4 students. If you have a large class, consider dividing the class in half, so each half has all four sections of text.)
 - Post one section of text per flip chart. Divide students into four groups and assign each group to one section of text. Students read and discuss the chart they are at first. They write a note about the gist and circle unfamiliar words.
 - Students rotate to each section of text, adding to/clarifying the gist and writing what they think words mean.

- At the end, students return to the section they began with and read the comments left there.
- D. Text dependent questions (15 minutes)
- Students work in pairs, with a copy of the text from all stations in front of them, to answer text dependent questions.
 - When they are done, teacher leads a debrief. Students should revise their Historian’s Notes as necessary.
 - ✓ Why does the state have to provide equal educational opportunities to all students?
 - ✓ In your own words, what is the question the case raises?
 - ✓ How does segregating the schools affect African American children?
 - ✓ Why does segregating schools mean that these segregated schools cannot provide equal educational opportunity?
- E. Exit Ticket (formative assessment) (10 min)
- Tell students that you want to see how well they can read like historians on their own. Direct them to do the Last Read independently and to complete the exit ticket question (In your own words, explain on what basis the Supreme Court ruled segregated schools unconstitutional.) individually.
 - Collect this work and use it to assess both whole class and individual needs. Consider how you might structure upcoming lessons to address these needs (modeling, showing exemplar work, conferring with individual students, pulling out a small flex group, etc.)
4. Closing and Assessment
- A. Adding to “Who is responsible for protecting civil rights?” anchor chart (5 min)
- Ask students to share the thinking on their exit tickets. (In your own words, explain on what basis the Supreme Court ruled segregated schools unconstitutional.)
 - Discuss: Who does this document suggest is responsible for protecting civil rights – individuals, groups, or the government? What makes you say that?
- B. Choose a quote from Brown vs. Board and add it to the Significant Quotations chart (10 min)
- Depending on how much support students need with this, consider offering them two choices and having them each select one.
5. Homework
- A. Read remainder of **Hakim, chapter 13**. Answer text-dependent questions. Note: These are on the **Historian’s Notes for this reading from Lesson 7**. (Why was Earl Warren significant? What did schools do after the Brown vs. Board of Education ruling? How did moderate and non-moderate white southerners respond to the ruling? When Hakim uses the word “moderate” to describe people, what does she mean? How can you tell?)

Use reading and class notes to fill in Brown vs. Board section of **Little Rock Nine Case Study Note catcher**.

Unit 3 - Andrew Carnegie: “The Gospel of Wealth” (1889) – A Close Reading

Part I

Directions: First, I will read the text aloud. Then, I will read the text aloud again and we will stop to discuss some of the vocabulary. On the second read, you should make notes on the vocabulary in the margins where appropriate, as well as highlight any points you feel are important. You are not expected to know all of the words or understand everything in these initial readings. We will reread this text very closely over several days to uncover its meaning.

The problem of our age is the administration of wealth, so that the ties of brotherhood may still bind together the rich and poor in **harmonious** relationship.

The conditions of human life have not only been changed, but revolutionized, within the past few hundred years. In former days there was little difference between the dwelling, dress, food, and environment of the chief and those of his **retainers**. . . . The contrast between the palace of the millionaire and the cottage of the laborer with us today measures the change which has come with civilization.

This change, however, is not to be **deplored**, but welcomed as highly beneficial. It is well, **nay** [*archaic; not only that but also*], essential for the progress of the race, that the houses of some should be homes for all that is highest and best in literature and the arts, and for all the refinements of civilization, rather than that none should be so. Much better this great irregularity than universal **squalor**. Without wealth there can be no **Maecenas** [*this is an allusion to Rome, he was a wealthy patron of the arts*]. The "good old times" were not good old times. Neither master nor servant was as well situated then as today. A relapse to old conditions would be disastrous to both - not the least so to him who serves - and would sweep away civilization with it....

...

We start, then, with a condition of affairs under which the best interests of the race are promoted, but which inevitably gives wealth to the few. Thus far, accepting conditions as they exist, the situation can be surveyed and pronounced good. The question then arises - and, if the foregoing be correct, it is the only question with which we have to deal-What is the proper mode of administering wealth after the laws upon which civilization is founded have thrown it into the hands of the few? And it is of this great question that I believe I offer the true solution. It will be understood that fortunes are here spoken of, not moderate sums saved by many years of effort, the returns from which are required for the comfortable maintenance and education of families. This is not wealth, but only **competence** [*adequacy; possession of required skills*], which it should be the aim of all to acquire.

There are but three **modes** in which **surplus** wealth can be disposed of. It can be left to the families of the **decedents**; or it can be **bequeathed** for **public purposes**; or, finally, it can be administered during their lives by its possessors. Under the first and second modes most of the wealth of the world that has reached the few has hitherto been applied.

Let us in turn consider each of these modes. The first is the most **injudicious**. In **monarchial** countries, the estates and the greatest portion of the wealth are left to the first son, that the vanity of the parent may be gratified by the thought that his name and title are to descend to succeeding generations **unimpaired**. The condition of this class in Europe today teaches the **futility** of such hopes or ambitions. The successors have become impoverished through their **follies** [*absurd or foolish action*] or from the fall in the value of land.... Why should men leave great fortunes to their children? If this is done from affection, is it not misguided affection? Observation teaches that, generally speaking, it is not well for the children that they should be so burdened. Neither is it well for the state. Beyond providing for the wife and daughters moderate sources of income, and very moderate allowances indeed, if any, for the sons, men may well hesitate, for it is no longer questionable that great sums bequeathed oftener work more for the injury than for the good of the recipients. Wise men will soon conclude that, for the best interests of the members of their families and of the state, such bequests are an improper use of their means.

...

As to the second mode, that of leaving wealth at death for public uses, it may be said that this is only a means for the disposal of wealth, provided a man is content to wait until he is dead before it becomes of much good in the world.... The cases are not few in which the real object sought by the **testator** is not attained, nor are they few in which his real wishes are **thwarted** [*to prevent something*]....

The growing **disposition** [*changing of thought patterns*] to tax more and more heavily large estates left at death is a cheering indication of the growth of a **salutary** change in public opinion.... Of all forms of taxation, this seems the wisest. Men who continue hoarding great sums all their lives, the proper use of which for public ends would work good to the community, should be made to feel that the community, in the form of the state, cannot thus be **deprived** of its proper share. By taxing estates heavily at death, the state marks its **condemnation** of the selfish millionaire's unworthy life.

It is desirable that nations should go much further in this direction. Indeed, it is difficult to set bounds to the share of a rich man's estate which should go at his death to the public through the agency of the state, and by all means such taxes should be **graduated** [*divided into stages*], beginning at nothing upon **moderate** [*not large, or too small*] sums to dependents, and increasing rapidly as the amounts swell. . . . This policy would work powerfully to induce the rich man to attend to the administration of wealth during his life, which is the end that society should always have in view, as being by far the most fruitful for the people. Nor need it be feared that this policy would sap the root of enterprise and **render** [*to make*] men less anxious to **accumulate**, for, to the class whose ambition it is to leave great fortunes and be talked about after their death, it will attract even more attention, and, indeed, be a somewhat nobler ambition to have enormous sums paid over to the state from their fortunes.

There remains, then, only one mode of using great fortunes: but in this way we have the true **antidote** [*something that reduces effects or helps solve a problem*] for the temporary unequal distribution of wealth, the **reconciliation** [*ending of conflict*] of the rich and the poor - a reign of harmony - another ideal, differing, indeed from that of the Communist in requiring only the further evolution of existing conditions, not the total overthrow of our civilization.

...

This, then, is held to be the duty of the man of Wealth: First, to set an example of modest, unostentatious living, shunning display or extravagance; to provide moderately for the legitimate wants of those dependent upon him; and after doing so to consider all surplus revenues which come to him simply as trust funds, which he is called upon to administer, and strictly bound as a matter of duty to administer in the manner which, in his judgment, is best calculated to produce the most beneficial result for the community - the man of wealth thus becoming

the sole agent and trustee for his poorer brethren, bringing to their service his superior wisdom, experience, and ability to administer-doing for them better than they would or could do for themselves.

If we consider what results flow from the **Cooper Institute** [a philanthropic organization], for instance, to the best portion of the race in New York not possessed of means, and compare these with those which would have arisen for the good of the masses from an equal sum distributed by Mr. Cooper in his lifetime in the form of wages, which is the highest form of distribution, being for work done and not for charity, we can form some estimate of the possibilities for the improvement of the race which lie embedded in the present law of the **accumulation** of wealth. Much of this sum if distributed in small quantities among the people, would have been wasted in the **indulgence** of appetite, some of it in excess, and it may be doubted whether even the part put to the best use, that of adding to the comforts of the home, would have yielded results for the race, as a race, at all comparable to those which are flowing and are to flow from the Cooper Institute from generation to generation. Let the advocate of violent or radical change ponder well this thought.

We might even go so far as to take another instance, that of Mr. Tilden's bequest of five millions of dollars for a free library in the city of New York, but in referring to this one cannot help saying involuntarily, how much better if Mr. Tilden had devoted the last years of his own life to the proper administration of this immense sum; in which case neither legal contest nor any other cause of delay could have interfered with his aims. But let us assume that Mr. Tilden's millions finally become the means of giving to this city a noble public library, where the treasures of the world contained in books will be open to all forever, without money and without price. Considering the good of that part of the race which congregates in and around Manhattan Island, would its permanent benefit have been better promoted had these millions been allowed to circulate in small sums through the hands of the masses? Even the most strenuous advocate of Communism must entertain a doubt upon this subject. Most of those who think will probably entertain no doubt whatever.

...

Thus is the problem of Rich and Poor to be solved. The laws of accumulation will be left free; the laws of distribution free. Individualism will continue, but the millionaire will be but a trustee for the poor; **entrusted** [*to make another responsible*] for a season with a great part of the increased wealth of the community, but administering it for the community far better than it could or would have done for itself. The best minds will thus have reached a stage in the development of the race which it is clearly seen that there is no mode of disposing of surplus wealth

creditable to thoughtful and earnest men into whose hands it flows save by using it year by year for the general good. This day already dawns. But a little while, and although, without incurring the pity of their fellows, men may die sharers in great business enterprises from which their capital cannot be or has not been withdrawn, and is left chiefly at death for public uses, yet the man who dies leaving behind many millions of available wealth, which was his to administer during life, will pass away " unwept, unhonored, and unsung," no matter to what uses he leaves the **dross** [*something that is worthless*] which he cannot take with him. Of such as these the public verdict will then be: "The man who dies thus rich dies disgraced."

Such, in my opinion, is the true Gospel concerning Wealth, obedience to which is destined someday to solve the problem of the Rich and the Poor, and to bring ' Peace on earth, among men Good-Will."

Original:

Andrew Carnegie, "Wealth," *North American Review*, 148, no. 391 (June 1889): 653, 657-62.

Retrieved from:

Bannister, Robert. "North American Review. Wealth." *American Intellectual History*. Swarthmore, 27 June 1995. Web. 27 July 2012.
<<http://www.swarthmore.edu/SocSci/rbannis1/AIH19th/Carnegie.html>>.

Part II: Text Dependent Questions

Use the following method to address each of the questions below:

- **Reread** the section of the text that precedes the question
- Take **notes** to help you formulate an answer to the question
- **Discuss** the question in a group
- Individually **write** what you think are the best answers to each question

Note to Teacher: Given the complexity of the text as well as the questions, teachers should not wait until groups have addressed all the questions before going over them. Especially in the beginning, it is important to ascertain that students are not going too far afield in their understanding of the points that Carnegie is making, as each idea builds on what precedes it.

The Text: “The Gospel of Wealth,” Andrew Carnegie

| Text | Question |
|---|---|
| <p>The problem of our age is the administration of wealth, so that the ties of brotherhood may still bind together the rich and poor in harmonious relationship.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What is the “age” Carnegie is talking about? The Gilded Age or the Industrial Revolution. Students should note the date given on the first page. |

The conditions of human life have not only been changed, but revolutionized, within the past few hundred years. In former days there was little difference between the dwelling, dress, food, and environment of the chief and those of his **retainers**. . . . The contrast between the palace of the millionaire and the cottage of the laborer with us today measures the change which has come with civilization.

- **What is a “harmonious relationship”?** Students should differentiate this meaning from other meanings of harmony, and identify that Carnegie is talking here about bettering relations between rich people and poor people.
- **What does Carnegie mean by “the administration of wealth”?** The notion of “administering wealth” is not explained until later in the text. At this point students should be given a chance to grapple with this idea, with teachers explaining that the class will return to it later.

Note to Teacher: The idea that some parts of a text might not be understood until further into the text is important for students to understand as they learn to engage with more complex text.

- **What is the “...change which has come with civilization” that Carnegie alludes to here?** In the past the “chief” and his “retainers” were very similar in their “...dress, food and environment.” This is no longer the case. The rich now live in mansions and the laborers in cottages.
- **What is Carnegie saying about this change and “civilization”?** He is saying that this change “comes with civilization.” This means that,

This change, however, is not to be **deplored**, but welcomed as highly beneficial. It is well, **nay** [*archaic; not only that but also*], essential for the progress of the race, that the houses of some should be homes for all that is highest and best in literature and the arts, and for all the refinements of civilization, rather than that none should be so. Much better this great irregularity than universal **squalor**. Without wealth there can be no **Maecenas** [*this is an allusion to Rome, he was a wealthy patron of the arts*]. The "good old times" were not good old times. Neither master nor servant was as well situated then as today. A relapse to old conditions would be disastrous to both - not the least so to him who serves - and would sweep away civilization with it....

...

according to Carnegie, when there was no civilization the "chief" and his "retainer" or follower were very much equal ("...little difference"). The difference only came – according to Carnegie – with civilization.

- **What is “this change” that Carnegie refers to in the first sentence of the paragraph to the left?**
 Students should see that this refers to the previous paragraph’s point that in the modern world, the rich and poor live differently—but that this was not always the case.
- **Carnegie makes a number of points in this paragraph; explain each of these (there should be about five or six).**
 1. The change is “beneficial.”
 2. Some people’s homes should have the “best in literature and the arts,” as this is better than none having it, which is what used to be. That some have this is “...essential for the progress of the race....”
 3. This “irregularity” is better than “universal squalor,” or everyone being poor, which used to be the case.

We start, then, with a condition of affairs under which the best interests of the race are promoted, but which inevitably gives wealth to the few. Thus far, accepting conditions as they exist, the situation can be surveyed and pronounced good. The question then arises - and, if

4. Without wealth, there would be no art, “...no Maecenas...” Ask students what this might mean. With discussion, students should see that there is a relationship between wealth and the arts in society. Ask, for example, what the effect on the arts would be if nobody had any “extra wealth.”
5. The past, “...the good old times...,” were not so good.
6. “A relapse to old conditions...” would be “disastrous,” especially to workers, “not the least so to him who serves.”

Note to the Teacher: This paragraph and this question should be used to point out to students that complex text is often dense in information and ideas, and that is one reason why it requires multiple, careful readings.

- **What is the “condition of affairs” in the first sentence here, and what are the “best interests” which Carnegie states this promotes?** The “condition of affairs” refers to the “great irregularity” or unequal distribution of wealth that Carnegie has been discussing. The “best interests” refers to the notion that this unequal distribution of wealth is better than “universal

the foregoing be correct, it is the only question with which we have to deal—What is the proper mode of administering wealth after the laws upon which civilization is founded have thrown it into the hands of the few? And it is of this great question that I believe I offer the true solution. It will be understood that fortunes are here spoken of, not moderate sums saved by many years of effort, the returns from which are required for the comfortable maintenance and education of families. This is not wealth, but only **competence** [*adequacy; possession of required skills*], which it should be the aim of all to acquire.

squalor” and is therefore, “...pronounced good...” and is in the “...best interests of the race.”

- **Carnegie states, “...the laws upon which Civilization is founded have thrown it {wealth} into the hands of the few...” What is he claiming are these “laws”? What does “law” mean in this context?** This is a difficult question as it involves tracing Carnegie’s ideas from when he first states the “...conditions of human life have been revolutionized...” in paragraph two to “...this change is highly beneficial...” in paragraph three to “the laws upon which Civilization is founded” in the above paragraph. In each case Carnegie is referring to the accumulation and unequal distribution of wealth, which have “revolutionized” human life for the good (“highly beneficial”). In the above paragraph, he goes further by saying this unequal distribution of wealth and the benefits it bestows are a “law of civilization.”

Note to the Teacher: Students may not be familiar with the notion of a “law” of civilization. If asked to address this they will likely realize that Carnegie is not talking about laws made by governments and enforced by police. With further thought some students will see that he is talking here about a principle or idea about how societies or civilizations work. Once students reach this understanding, teachers should point out that Carnegie is making the

There are but three **modes** in which **surplus** wealth can be disposed of. It can be left to the families of the **decedents**; or it can be **bequeathed** for **public purposes**; or, finally, it can be administered during their lives

claim here that unequal accumulation of wealth as a “...law of civilization” is the way civilization comes from non-civilization. In other words, this is the way we become civilized. Teachers should point this out as an example of how we can learn from close reading and how students can do this on their own as they get better.

- **What is the main question that Carnegie is posing here?** Carnegie is asking what we do with this wealth which only a few people have, “... administering wealth... thrown into the hands of the few”? Some students might also note that Carnegie is saying this is the only question we need address.
- **What differences between types of wealth does Carnegie define?** He distinguishes between “fortunes” and great wealth, “...not moderate sums... the aim of all to acquire.”
- **What is “surplus wealth”?** Money that goes beyond what a family needs to get by on a daily basis.
- **What are the two most common things that happen to “surplus wealth” after a person dies, according to Carnegie?** It is inherited, or it is

by its possessors. Under the first and second modes most of the wealth of the world that has reached the few has hitherto been applied.

Let us in turn consider each of these modes. The first is the most **injudicious**. In **monarchial** countries, the estates and the greatest portion of the wealth are left to the first son, that the vanity of the parent may be gratified by the thought that his name and title are to descend to succeeding generations **unimpaired**. The condition of this class in Europe today teaches the **futility** of such hopes or ambitions. The successors have become impoverished through their **follies** [*absurd or foolish action*] or from the fall in the value of land.... Why should men leave great fortunes to their children? If this is done from affection, is it not misguided affection? Observation teaches that, generally speaking, it is not well for the children that they should be so burdened. Neither is it well for the state. Beyond providing for the wife and daughters moderate sources of income, and very moderate allowances indeed, if any, for the sons, men may well hesitate, for it is no longer questionable that great sums bequeathed oftener work more for the injury than for the good of the recipients. Wise men will soon conclude that, for the best interests of the members of their families and of the state, such bequests are an improper use of their means.

...

given away to charities or taken by the government after the wealthy person died.

- **What does Carnegie mean by inheriting wealth is a “burden” to male children? What evidence does he provide for this?** “... impoverished through their follies... work more for the injury than for the good.” He believes they will not act wisely and waste the money, while only harming themselves. Students should see that Carnegie’s evidence is what he himself has seen or perhaps heard of from speaking with others: “Observation teaches that...” At some point the question of what exactly “observation” means here, and whether it is sufficient evidence, should be discussed.
- **Why does Carnegie believe that wives and daughters should receive moderate “allowances”?** Women at the time weren’t allowed to work and would have to marry to support themselves.

Note to Teacher: This is a point that must be inferred by the reader, and is dependent upon prior knowledge of the century. Many students would know that in this period few wealthy women worked. However, students might infer this even if they did not have the background knowledge or if that knowledge was not terribly secure or “at their

As to the second mode, that of leaving wealth at death for public uses, it may be said that this is only a means for the disposal of wealth, provided a man is content to wait until he is dead before it becomes of much good in the world.... The cases are not few in which the real object sought by the **testator** is not attained, nor are they few in which his real wishes are **thwarted** [*to prevent something*]....

The growing **disposition** [*changing of thought patterns*] to tax more and more heavily large estates left at death is a cheering indication of the growth of a **salutary** change in public opinion.... Of all forms of taxation, this seems the wisest. Men who continue hoarding great

fingertips.” If this is the case, the posing of the question itself and students attempt to answer it might serve the purpose of bringing the background knowledge to the fore or inferring that this is likely the reason Carnegie is stating this. In this way students are acquiring the background knowledge from careful reading.

- **Rewrite the last sentence in the paragraph to the left so that it isn’t a double negative... i.e. put it in the positive! Or, explain what the last sentence means.**

There are many cases where what the testator wants to happen, doesn’t; others involved in the process prevent the original wishes of the deceased. Carnegie is saying here that these two means don’t work out in practice.

Note to Teacher: Point out to students that the last sentence is a double negative. This sentence structure is frequently difficult to comprehend, and requires multiple readings. Encourage students to rephrase the sentence so that it is a positive statement.

- **Why does Carnegie believe that there should be a tax on “...large estates left at death...”? Carnegie believes that the community or the state should be able to use the wealth that has been accumulated. The state deserves its “proper share.”**

sums all their lives, the proper use of which for public ends would work good to the community, should be made to feel that the community, in the form of the state, cannot thus be **deprived** of its proper share. By taxing estates heavily at death, the state marks its **condemnation** of the selfish millionaire's unworthy life.

It is desirable that nations should go much further in this direction. Indeed, it is difficult to set bounds to the share of a rich man's estate which should go at his death to the public through the agency of the state, and by all means such taxes should be **graduated** [*divided into stages*], beginning at nothing upon **moderate** [*not large, or too small*] sums to dependents, and increasing rapidly as the amounts swell. . . . This policy would work powerfully to induce the rich man to attend to the administration of wealth during his life, which is the end that society should always have in view, as being by far the most fruitful for the people. Nor need it be feared that this policy would sap the root of enterprise and **render** [*to make*] men less anxious to **accumulate**, for, to the class whose ambition it is to leave great fortunes and be talked about after their death, it will attract even more attention, and, indeed, be a somewhat nobler ambition to have enormous sums paid over to the state from their fortunes.

- **What did Carnegie mean by “...such taxes should be graduated...”?** This refers to the idea that the rate or percent of the tax should increase according to the amount of money or wealth the deceased has accumulated. Students might recognize this as similar to the way income taxes work. This can be determined from the context: “...beginning at nothing upon moderate...increasing rapidly as the amounts swell...”
- **Ultimately, what did Carnegie hope the effect of a tax at death would be?** Carnegie hoped that by doing this, wealthy people would give away their money while they were alive: “to induce the rich man to attend the administration of wealth during his life.” By doing this the wealth would be put to more efficient use, as he notes in previous paragraphs.

There remains, then, only one mode of using great fortunes: but in this way we have the true **antidote** [*something that reduces effects or helps solve a problem*] for the temporary unequal distribution of wealth, the **reconciliation** [*ending of conflict*] of the rich and the poor - a reign of harmony - another ideal, differing, indeed from that of the Communist in requiring only the further evolution of existing conditions, not the total overthrow of our civilization.

...

This, then, is held to be the duty of the man of Wealth: First, to set an example of modest, unostentatious living, shunning display or extravagance; to provide moderately for the legitimate wants of those dependent upon him; and after doing so to consider all surplus revenues which come to him simply as trust funds, which he is called upon to administer, and strictly bound as a matter of duty to administer in the manner which, in his judgment, is best calculated to produce the most beneficial result for the community - the man of wealth thus becoming the sole agent and trustee for his poorer brethren, bringing to their service his superior wisdom, experience, and

- **In the paragraph to the left, Carnegie addresses a criticism that might be made against this argument. What criticism is this, and how does he address it?** Carnegie addresses the argument that a tax on wealthy people’s money might cause them to not work so hard to accumulate their wealth. A death tax would “sap the root of enterprise” and cause people to be “less anxious to accumulate” wealth. He addresses this potential criticism by saying that wealthy people will want to do this, “...for the class whose ambition it is... it will attract even more attention...” Teachers should point out here that Carnegie is making an argument and a good argument should anticipate and address criticisms.
- **What is Carnegie saying is the, “...duty of the man of wealth...”?** To live modestly: “...set an example of...modest living....” To modestly support those dependent upon him: “...legitimate wants of those dependent...” To administer, using his judgment, the “surplus revenues...for the, ‘poorer brethren’ which he can do better than they “could for themselves.”

ability to administer-doing for them better than they would or could do for themselves.

If we consider what results flow from the **Cooper Institute** [a philanthropic organization], for instance, to the best portion of the race in New York not possessed of means, and compare these with those which would have arisen for the good of the masses from an equal sum distributed by Mr. Cooper in his lifetime in the form of wages, which is the highest form of distribution, being for work done and not for charity, we can form some estimate of the possibilities for the improvement of the race which lie embedded in the present law of the **accumulation** of wealth. Much of this sum if distributed in small quantities among the people, would have been wasted in the **indulgence** of appetite, some of it in excess, and it may be doubted whether even the part put to the best use, that of adding to the comforts of the home, would have yielded results for the race, as a race, at all comparable to those which are flowing and are to flow from the Cooper Institute from generation to generation. Let the advocate of violent or radical change ponder well this thought.

- **What is Carnegie saying is another, alternative mode of dealing with excess wealth?** “in the form of wages” i.e. paying people more. In other words, instead of the person of great wealth “administering” this excess wealth while alive and as he sees fit, he would instead raise wages or pay more to those working for him.
- **Why does Carnegie consider this mode less desirable?** Carnegie is saying here that increasing wages is not as good as wealthy people administering their wealth: “it would be wasted in the indulgence of appetite,” i.e. frivolous spending by those who are given these wages (the workers).

We might even go so far as to take another instance, that of Mr. Tilden's bequest of five millions of dollars for a free library in the city of New York, but in referring to this one cannot help saying involuntarily, how much better if Mr. Tilden had devoted the last years of his own life to the proper administration of this immense sum; in which case neither legal contest nor any other cause of delay could have interfered with his aims. But let us assume that Mr. Tilden's millions finally become the means of giving to this city a noble public library, where the treasures of the world contained in books will be open to all forever, without money and without price. Considering the good of that part of the race which congregates in and around Manhattan Island, would its permanent benefit have been better promoted had these millions been allowed to circulate in small sums through the hands of the masses? Even the most strenuous advocate of Communism must entertain a doubt upon this subject. Most of those who think will probably entertain no doubt whatever.

...

Thus is the problem of Rich and Poor to be solved. The laws of accumulation will be left free; the laws of distribution free. Individualism will continue, but the millionaire will be but a trustee for the poor; **entrusted** [*to make another responsible*] for a season with a great part of the increased wealth of the community, but

- **What were Mr. Tilden’s actions and why does Carnegie disagree with them?** He made a large, charitable donation upon his death, which got tied up legally. Teachers should point out that this goes back to Carnegie’s earlier argument that this money should be administered by the men who earned it.
- **In this last paragraph Carnegie summarizes his argument. What main points does he review?** The laws of “accumulation” will be left free. This means there will be no laws made to stop people

administering it for the community far better than it could or would have done for itself. The best minds will thus have reached a stage in the development of the race which it is clearly seen that there is no mode of disposing of surplus wealth creditable to thoughtful and earnest men into whose hands it flows save by using it year by year for the general good. This day already dawns. But a little while, and although, without incurring the pity of their fellows, men may die sharers in great business enterprises from which their capital cannot be or has not been withdrawn, and is left chiefly at death for public uses, yet the man who dies leaving behind many millions of available wealth, which was his to administer during life, will pass away " unwept, unhonored, and unsung," no matter to what uses he leaves the **dross** [*something that is worthless*] which he cannot take with him. Of such as these the public verdict will then be: "The man who dies thus rich dies disgraced."

Such, in my opinion, is the true Gospel concerning Wealth, obedience to which is destined some day to solve the problem of the Rich and the Poor, and to bring ' Peace on earth, among men Good-Will."

from acquiring great wealth. Carnegie calls this "individualism."

Men of wealth will use their accumulated wealth for the general good: "administering for the community," "for the general good," ... care for others." They can do this better than the community, "...would have done for itself...."

The people who know the most, "...the best minds," will realize that this is the best way. Carnegie is getting at the idea that the "best minds" will soon see this is the best thing to do with surplus wealth.

- **Why does Carnegie consider his plan a "gospel"?**
 He is saying that just as religion is supposed to bring "peace on earth" and "happiness," his plan will do the same. This gives greater weight to his argument.

Part III: The Culminating Activity

ANALYSIS: As a class we will review the following questions:

- A. What is the key argument that Carnegie is making in this piece?

Students should recognize that he is arguing that the wealthy have earned their wealth, have a duty to help others, and should do so as they best see fit, as they are superior. There is also religious grounding in his argument

- B. How does he develop his argument?

Students should be able to identify these main chunks of the text:

- I. Describes the effects of the industrial revolution on income and income distribution
- II. Analyzes what is beneficial about these changes
- III. Describes and analyzes current ways of handling great wealth, poses question of how it should be handled
- IV. Supports the growing idea of a death tax, but also says that this alone is not sufficient i.e. rather than a death tax, which he says is inefficient, we need to have wealthy administer their wealth as they see fit while alive.
- V. Responds to arguments outside of text (Capitalism & Communism)
- VI. Proposes his argument – administer it oneself
- VII. Problem of other modes

- C. What evidence does he provide?

Students should be able to pull these main illustrations used by Carnegie to support his arguments, and they should also be able to identify the points of argument used in their response to the focusing question:

- I. The palace and the cottage

- II. Squalor and Maecenas of Rome
- III. Inheritors (male vs. female) and the public need
- IV. Death tax does benefit society
- V. Doesn't sap the root of enterprise
- VI. Because the wealthy are superior for having earned
- VII. Wasted in indulgences – The Cooper Institute
- VIII. Mr. Tilden – legal disputes

Then, independently, write a paragraph to answer the following focusing question. Cite specific evidence from the text to support your claims. Please e-mail your response as an attached Word document.

Do you believe the evidence provided is sufficient to support Carnegie's argument?

RESEARCH: Conduct research using two resources to address the following essential question in a five paragraph essay. You must document your research process and share it with me. Include an MLA Works Cited and parenthetical citations in your essay.

Carnegie argues that in his age there is a "...temporary unequal distribution of wealth." Was it temporary? Compare the difference between the wealthy and the poor today to the age of Carnegie?

This Close Reading and Culminating Activity address Common Core Reading Standards #1-6, 9 & 10; Writing Standards #1, 4, & 7-9.