CTDEP NOx Trading Order Policy Options Under Consideration October 27, 2009

Overview

- Section 22 w/trading as a compliance option yielded reductions in the total emissions of NOx within CT from stationary sources
- CT's has not attained the 1997 Ozone NAAQS and federal mandates require additional NOx emissions reductions
- The current Trading Orders do not adequately protect and preserve current emissions or encourage consideration of further controls
- A number of RCSA Section 22a-174-22 NOx trading order extension options are under consideration

Health Effects O3 and PM2.5

- <u>Ozone & PM2.5</u>: airway irritation; reduced lung capacity; asthma aggravation; permanent lung damage
- <u>PM2.5</u>: irregular heartbeat; heart attacks; premature death in those with heart or lung disease
- <u>Benefits of Attainment</u>: EPA estimates \$2-17 billion for ozone and \$17-35 billion for PM2.5



Air Quality Management Process "What Comes Around Goes Around"



New Mandates to Affect NOx Sources

- 2010 reconsidered O3 NAAQS (EPA)
- 2010 CAIR replacement rule (EPA)
- 2011 Reconsidered PM2.5 NAAQS (EPA)
- 2010+ Revised Hg rule (EPA)
- Greenhouse Gas Programs (EPA, Congress, RGGI, CT)

Our Air Pollution Comes From



- Local emissions
- Transport Short range Long range

CT's Ozone SIP Status

- Submitted 1997 O3 Attainment Demonstration with commitments, 1Feb08
- EPA published proposed disapproval 8May09 (several rules lacking; modeling too optimistic)
- Need continuous reasonable further progress (RFP)
- 2009 clean data holding off disapproval
- Tighter standard and additional reductions needed for next SIP

From CT's O3 SIP: Projected Anthropogenic NOx Emission Trends for Connecticut



9

Why do more now?

- Making good progress, but not attainment
- Relying on past two years is overly optimistic (cool weather and slow economy)
- Gaps to fill for the 1997 O3 NAAQS (84 ppb)
- Need more local reductions for reconsidered 2010 O3 NAAQS (≤70 ppb)

Regional Control Strategies Under Development

- Collaborative. Coal EGUs.
- Mobile sources.
- Architectural Coating and Consumer Products.
- EGU and Non-EGU Boilers. Reduced NOx limits
- Peak Day EGU.
- Municipal Waste Combustors. Tighter NOx emission limits
- Small Natural Gas-Fired Boilers, Process Heaters and Water Heaters. Ultra Low NOx Burners

Connecticut's High Electric Demand Day (HEDD) Progress



State's Obligation

- Fulfill obligations under the federal Clean Air Act
 - Develop a plan and attain.
 - Do not impede downwind State's efforts to achieve attainment.

NOx Trading Orders

- 1994 NOx RACT Concept
 - Allow ERC trading for sources that cannot comply with NOx limits
 - Many old sources with limited life span remaining
 - Most cost effective approach
 - Never intended to last into perpetuity
- NOx trading program is now 15 years old
- More NOx reductions needed to meet mandates

***NBP Source NOx Emissions**

NOx (tons/year)



*Budget Sources are the largest NOx emitting sources in the State.



Non-Ozone Season DERC Creation vs. Usage

■ Creation ■ Usage



Current Trading Orders

- Source retires 1 DERC or allowance for each ton of emissions in excess of regulatory limit.
- No longer parity between cost of credit and cost effective control.
- Does not encourage real consideration of costeffective controls or equipment replacement.
- Do not adequately protect or preserve current emissions reduction levels.

NOx Control Costs (\$/ton)



State Framework

- Fulfill obligations under the federal Clean Air Act
- Achieve public health goals cost effectively
- Allow for NOx allowance or DERC use subject to permit or order
- Permits/orders can be conditional

Trading Program Policy Options for Short-term Order Renewals

- Establish a multi-tiered program that distinguishes categories of equipment
- Require low cost modifications or optimization as a prerequisite to credit use
- Increase the DERC/allowance ratio for high NOx emitters
- Continue trading for a limited period of time in combination with commitment to a lower NOx emission rate at a future date
- Establish a new baseline for "surplus"

Changes under Consideration (continued)

- Use trading orders as a mechanism to address HEDD commitment
- Discontinue to allow the use of NOx allowances or impose a geographic restriction on NOx allowance use
- Other?

Next steps

- Impacted stakeholder input
- Agency decision on terms for renewal of orders
- Follow EPA's regulatory agenda and determine appropriate regulatory changes to pursue