# STATE OF CONNECTICUT CONNECTICUT SITING COUNCIL

CPV TOWANTIC, LLC MOTION TO REOPEN AND MODIFY THE JUNE 23, 1999 CERTIFICATE OF ENVIRONMENTAL COMPATABILITY AND PUBLIC NEED BASED ON CHANGED CONDITIONS PURSUANT TO CONNECTICUT GENERAL STATUTES § 4-181A(B) FOR THE CONSTRUCTION, MAINTENANCE AND OPERATION OF A 785 MW DUAL –FUEL COMBINED CYCLE ELECTRIC GENERATING FACILITY LOCATED NORTH OF THE PROKOP ROAD AND TOWANTIC HILL ROAD INTERSECTION IN THE TOWN OF OXFORD, CONNECTICUT DOCKET NO. 192B

APRIL 27, 2015

:

:

:

•

•

## PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT PROFFERED BY THE TOWN OF MIDDLEBURY

In the notice dated March 27, 2015, Melanie Bachman, Executive Director of the Connecticut Siting Council, advised the evidentiary record was closed and repeated the due date of April 27, 2015 for parties and intervenors to submit briefs and findings of fact which had been previously announced at the conclusion of the prior day's final evidentiary hearing . On April 16, 2015, in an open meeting the Council's issued and discussed the initial draft Findings of Fact dated April 10, 2015 ("Draft I") prepared by Council staff in the above-referenced contested proceeding. Formatted as Two hundred sixty-six (266) enumerated Findings, set forth as singlespaced typed paragraphs of various lengths on thirty-nine pages (39) excluding the Appendix, this first draft fairly represents the history of the proceedings since the issuance of the first approval of the 512 MW electric-generating facility at this site in 1999 through the second approval that reviewed the 512 MW facility in its first ten (10) pages. The additional twenty-nine (29) pages set forth the proceedings and description of the on the alternate proposal before the Council divided by the usual categories of review.

However, the plain reading of Draft I, reveals this document as an effort by the Council

staff to cull the record of the substantive facts weighted toward **an approval** of the pending CPV Towantic, LLC 's Motion to Reopen and Modify; not toward a denial. Fairness in the proceedings to this date requires either a separate draft Findings of Fact be prepared that cites the facts weighted toward a denial or within the next draft issued by the Council staff a greater effort be made to cite to the written and oral testimony of the several intervenors and plethora of public comments received in writing over the past twenty-six (26) weeks conspicuously absent in this Draft I. This initial Findings of Fact mentions the eighteen intervenors but provides no summaries and virtually none of the salient points provided in written testimony and crossexamination of the Applicant.

As an intervenor to the proceedings, the Town of Middlebury hereby proffers the following findings of fact with each paragraph prefaced as MIDD#:

- The Introduction should be reordered to commence with "Jurisdiction, General" (DRAFT I #19- 20) thus # 19 becomes MIDD# 1; #20 should be eliminated as repetitive of DRAFT I #1 which becomes MIDD# 2. Thereafter, setting forth the history of the project chronologically better prefaces the background the subject Motion to Reopen and Modify and thus move the present Council's response to the Petition (DRAFT I #4- 12) once the 16 year prior history is itemized.
- 2. The first history subsequent to the grant of 1999 Certificate is the Development and Management Plan (DRAFT I #21-28) adopted as MIDD#3- 10.
- 3. The next phase in the history is the "Requests for Extension of Time" (DRAFT I #26-34) culminating in the current operative deadline (DRAFT I #35) adopted as MIDD#11- 19. The current request for an additional extension is a part of the current application and so should be set forth immediately following the filing date of the Petition (DRAFT I #36) reordered and moved to MIDD#30
- 4. The next phase in the history is the <u>Prior</u> "Reopenings" as the current matter is listed separately (DRAFT I #37-43) adopted as MIDD#20-26.
- 5. Finally, the Introduction setting forth the history to date includes the Operating Reports (DRAFT I #44-46) adopted as MIDD#27-29.
- 6. By reordering the Introduction, particularly removing the detail of the Docket 192B (DRAFT I #4-12) proceedings until after the recitation of the chronological history of the project to date it better frames this unprecedented third Reopening and proposed

modification of all the core elements of the electric generating facility at Oxford. Thus, following the Petition (DRAFT I#3), the inclusion of a further extension of time(DRAFT I#36), and Applicant's proffered "Changed Circumstances" (DRAFT I#47-48), the Docket 192B proceedings – under the descriptive heading "Hearing Schedule", together are better clustered and so adopted as MIDD#29, 30, 31-32 and 33-41, respectively.

- 7. Again, it is disjointed to set forth the "State Agencies Comments" on the current application before the full history of the project is introduced and the relation of the comments to the proposed modifications. Thus, the "State Agencies Comments" (DRAFT I #13-18) are in their usual placement following Procedure (but for this Motion to Reopen and Modify the suggested renaming as "Hearing Schedule") adopted as MIDD#42-47.
- 8. The next substantive section, at the core of the Council's mandate, is the assessment of "Public Benefit" typically placed first after the Introduction/Procedure recitation. Accordingly, "Public Benefit" (DRAFT I #49-60) is next adopted as MIDD#48-59. However, the final four findings of "Public Benefit" (DRAFT I #61-64) are projections of the Applicant with no independent corroboration not appropriate for the Council to adopt as a Fact unless the Council intends to expand its forecast and delve into projected pollutant levels in New England, wholesale energy cost per consumer, projected household electricity bills in 2024 and jobs produced by individual projects. Accordingly, "Public Benefit" (DRAFT I #61-64) should be deleted in their entirety and so are not adopted as part of proffered Town of Middlebury Finding of Facts.
- 9. The balance of DRAFT I (#65 266) is adopted as part of proffered Town of Middlebury Finding of Facts with the exception of the final "Air Quality Issue" DRAFT I #265 as a substantive conclusion debated throughout the proceedings and not independently supported by any governmental agency. According, "Air Quality Issue" DRAFT I #265 should be deleted.
- 10. Added in the findings proffered as Town of Middlebury Finding of Facts are two new sections placed in the relevant order to the related section including "Surrounding Area" following "Proposed Site" and "Wetlands adjacent to site" to follow "Wetlands" renamed for clarity as "Wetlands- at site". These sections were added to reflect the Council's usual prevue and mention of the off-site conditions that were lacking in the Applicant's presentation but developed in the Record by other parties and intervenors. These off-site facts are critical to the determination of environmental impact.
- 11. The added findings under the proposed headings including "Surrounding Area" following "Proposed Site" and "Wetlands adjacent to site" to follow "Wetlands" (renamed for clarity as "Wetlands- at site") are self-explanatory and need no discussion here.

#### Surrounding Area

71. The cluster of residences, previously identified as Triangle Park, located in Middlebury north of the Waterbury –Oxford Airport in [Docket 192 FOF 57] were relocated as part of a noise and safety abatement project funded by the Federal

Aviation Administration.

- **72.** Included in the operation at the Waterbury-Oxford Airport is new pilot training that include flights operation with light sport model planes
- **73.** The Middlebury Land Trust maintains more than 1219Acres in open space and trails in the Town of Middlebury including Larkin Pond east of the site project
- 74. Additional residences have been build to the Southeast of the site identified as oxford Greens – 360 units build to date but approved for an additional 540 units by the Town of Oxford land use authorities.
- 75. Westover Hills Subdivision is another cluster of residences east of the project site.

Etc. - additional references to the Surrounding Area to the Project Site

#### Wetlands- adjacent to the site

- **247.** The wetland system to the west of the project site associated with the Jack's Brook is considered valuable because they support a number of important functions and values.
- **248.** The area westerly of the project site is suitable for mitigation of the disturbance that occurred to the wetlands on the project site.

Etc. - additional references to the off-site wetlands, watercourses and ecology

12. In order to track the proposed changes of DRAFT I, the following chart is submitted.

Section Heading	DRAFT I Numbering	Middlebury Numbering	Changes
INTRODUCTION	19	1	Moved
Jurisdiction, General	20	-	deleted
Procedure	1	2	moved
Certificate Status D and M Plan	21 – 25	3-7	moved
Requests for Extensions	26-35	8-17	moved
Prior Reopenings	37-43	18-24	moved

Proposed Reordering, Additions and Deletions of DRAFT I proffered as Town of Middlebury Finding of Facts

Operative Reports	44-46	26-28	moved
PETITION	3	29	moved
	36	30	moved
Changed Circumstances	47-48	31-32	moved
Hearing Schedule	4 - 12	33-41	moved
State Agency Comments	13-18	42-47	moved
Public Benefit	49-60	48-59	moved
5	61-63	-	deleted
Proposed Site	65-71	64-70	moved
Surrounding Area	-	71-81	added
Proposed Project	72-94	82-104	moved
Permits and Approvals	95-110	105-120	moved
Water Use	111-127	121-137	moved
Water Discharge	128-132	137-142	moved
Project Fuel	133-147	143-157	moved
Electrical	148-159	158-169	moved
Interconnection			
Project	160-166	170-176	moved
Construction			
Facility Operation	167-175	177-185	moved
Fire Protection And Safety	176-182	186-195	moved
ENVIRONMENT			
Visibility	183-190	196-203	moved
Exhaust Plumes	191-195	204-208	moved
Noise	196-205	209-218	moved
Traffic	206-208	219-221	moved
Historic and Archaeological Effects	209-213	222-226	moved
Geology of the Proposed Site	214-219	227-232	moved

Wetlands <u>– on site</u>	220-233	233-246	moved
<u>Wetlands –</u> adjacent to site		247-257	added
Site Ecology	234-251	258-275	moved
Air Quality Issues	252-264	276-288	moved
	265		deleted
Solid and Hazardous Waste	266	289	moved

### TOWN OF MIDDLEBURY

Stephen L. Savarese 103 South Main Street Newtown, CT 06470 Tel. 203-270-1144 Fax 203-270-0077 Email: attystephensavarese@gmail.com

### CERTIFICATION

This is to certify that an original and twenty (15) copies of the foregoing were hand delivered by to The Connecticut Siting council, 10 Franklin Square, new Britain, CT 06051and one copy of the above was mailed or electronically delivered on this 27<sup>th</sup> day of April 2015, on the applicant, parties and intervenors on the attached service list.

Stephen L./Savarese Commissioner of the Superior Court

Docket No. 192B Page 1 of 5

Status Granted	Status Holder (name, address & phone number)	Representative (name, address & phone number)
Applicant	CPV Towantic, L.L.C.	Franca L. DeRosa, Esq. Philip M. Small, Esq. Brown Rudnick LLP 185 Asylum Street Hartford, CT 06103 (860) 509-6500 (860) 509-6501 – fax <u>fderosa@brownrudnick.com</u> <u>psmall@brownrudnick.com</u>
Party	Jay Halpern 58 Jackson Cove Road Oxford, CT 06478 h: 203-888-4976 <u>zoarmonster@sbcglobal.net</u> Peter Thomas 72 Towantic Hill Rd. Oxford, CT 06478 203-720-1536	
Intervenor	Town of Middlebury	Attorney Dana A. D'Angelo Law Offices of Dana D'Angelo, LLC 20 Woodside Avenue Middlebury, CT 06762 (203) 598-3336 (203) 598-7283 – fax Dangelo.middlebury@snet.net Stephen L. Savarese, Esq. 103 South Main Street Newtown, CT 06470 203-270-0077 attystephensavarese@gmail.com
Intervenor	The Connecticut Light and Power Company (CL&P)	

#### LIST OF PARTIES AND INTERVENORS SERVICE LIST

	Status Holder	Representative
Status Granted	(name, address & phone number)	(name, address & phone number)
	CL&P continued	John R. Morissette Manager-Transmission Siting and Permitting The Connecticut Light and Power Company P.O. Box 270 Hartford, CT 06141-0270 (860) 665-2036 morisjr@nu.com
		Christopher R. Bernard Manager, Regulatory Policy (Transmission) The Connecticut Light and Power Company P.O. Box 270 Hartford, CT 06141-0270 (860) 665-5967 (860) 665-3314 – fax <u>bernacr@nu.com</u>
		Stella Pace, Senior Engineer The Connecticut Light and Power Company Transmission and Interconnection Dept. P.O. Box 270 Hartford, CT 06141-0270 (860) 665-3569 <u>pacess@nu.com</u>
		Jeffery D. Cochran Northeast Utilities Service Company 107 Selden Street Berlin, CT 06037 860-665-3548 <u>cochrjd@nu.com</u>
Party	Town of Oxford	Kevin W. Condon, Esq. Condon & Savitt PC P.O. Box 570 Ansonia, CT 06401 203-734-2511 condonsavitt@comcast.net
Party	Naugatuck Valley Chapter Trout Unlimited	Robert M. Perrella, Vice President TU Naugatuck/Pomperaug Valley Chapter 278 W. Purchase Road Southbury, CT 06488-1004 johnnytroutseed@charter.net

Date: February 9, 2015

Docket No. 192B Page 3 of 5

Town of Southbury	Ed Edelson First Selectman Town of Southbury 501 Main Street Southbury, CT 06488 <u>selectman@southbury-ct.gov</u> (203) 262-0647 (203) 264-9762 – fax
The Pomperaug River Watershed Coalition	Len DeJong, Executive Director Pomperaug River Watershed Coalition 39 Sherman Hill Road, C103 Woodbury, CT 06798 203-263-0076 LDeJong@pomperaug.org
Raymond Pietrorazio 764 Charcoal Avenue Middlebury, CT 06762-1311 (203) 758-2413 (203) 758-9519 – fax <u>ray@ctcombustion.com</u>	
GE Energy Financial Services, Inc.	Jay F. Malcynsky The Law Offices of Jay F. Malcynsky, P.C. One Liberty Square New Britain, CT 06051 (860) 229-0301 (860) 225-4627 – fax Jmalcynsky@gaffneybennett.com
Borough of Naugatuck and Borough of Naugatuck Water Pollution Control Authority	Edward G. Fitzpatrick, Esq. Alicia K. Perillo, Esq. Fitzpatrick, Mariano, Santos, Sousa, PC 203 Church Street Naugatuck, CT 06770 203-729-4555 <u>Fitz@fmslaw.org</u> <u>alicia@fmslaw.org</u> Ronald Merancy, Chairman Water Pollution Control Authority 229 Church Street Naugatuck, CT 06770 203-720-7000
	The Pomperaug River Watershed Coalition Raymond Pietrorazio 764 Charcoal Avenue Middlebury, CT 06762-1311 (203) 758-2413 (203) 758-9519 – fax ray@ctcombustion.com GE Energy Financial Services, Inc. Borough of Naugatuck and Borough of Naugatuck Water Pollution Control

Date: February 9, 2015

Docket No. 192B Page 4 of 5

Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Wayne McCormack 593 Putting Green Lane Oxford, CT 06478 <u>wayne@waynemccormack.com</u>	
Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Naugatuck River Revival Group, Inc.	Kevin R. Zak, President Naugatuck River Revival Group, Inc. 132 Radnor Avenue Naugatuck, CT 06770 kznrrg@sbcglobal.net 203-530-7850
Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Westover Hills Subdivision Homeowners	Chester Cornacchia Westover Hills Subdivision Homeowners 53 Graham Ridge Road Naugatuck, CT 06770 203-206-9927 <u>cc@necsonline.com</u>
Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Westover School	Kate J. Truini Alice Hallaran Westover School 1237 Whittemore Road Middlebury, CT 06762 203-758-2423 <u>ktruini@westoverschool.org</u> <u>ahallaran@westoverschool.org</u>
Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Greenfields, LLC and Marian Larkin	Edward S. Hill, Esq. Cappalli & Hill, LLC 325 Highland Avenue Cheshire, CT 06410 203-272-2607 <u>ehill@cappallihill.com</u>
Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Lake Quassapaug Association, LLC	Ingrid Manning, Vice President Lake Quassapaug Association, LLC P.O. Box 285 Middlebury, CT 06762 203-758-1692 <u>Ingridmanning2@gmail.com</u>

Intervenor (Approved on January 8, 2015)	Middlebury Land Trust, Inc.	W. Scott Peterson, M.D., President Middlebury Land Trust, Inc. 317 Tranquility Road Middlebury, CT 06762 203-574-2020 wsp@aya.yale.edu
Intervenor (Approved on January 15, 2015)	Quassy Amusement Park	George Frantzis Quassy Amusement Park P.O. Box 1107 Middlebury, CT 06762 203-758-2913 ext 108 <u>george@quassy.com</u>
Intervenor (Approved on January 15, 2015)	Middlebury Bridle Land Association	Nancy Vaughan Middlebury Bridle Land Association 61 Sandy Hill Road Middlebury, CT' 06762 203-598-0697 ndzijavaughan@gmail.com
Intervenor (Approved on January 15, 2015)	Dennis Kocyla 28 Benz Street Ansonia, CT 06401 203-736-7182 <u>Dennis3141@yahoo.com</u>	
Intervenor (Approved on January 15, 2015)	Naugatuck Valley Audubon Society	Sophie Zyla Jeff Ruhloff Carl Almonte Naugatuck Valley Audubon Society 17 Stoddard Place Beacon Falls, CT 06403 203-888-7945 <u>NVASeditor@mail.com</u>
Intervenor (Approved on January 15, 2015)	Oxford Flying Club	Burton L. Stevens Oxford Flying Club, Inc. P.O. Box 371 Woodbury, CT 06798 203-236-5158 <u>bstevens@snet.net</u>